HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT



Planning Proposal No. 29 & 31 Moore Road and No.64 Undercliff Road, Freshwater September 2023 | J4146



Level 19, 100 William Street, Woolloomooloo NSW 2011 Phone: (02) 8076 5317

CONTENTS

<u>1 I</u>	NTRODUCTION	1
1.1	Preamble	1
1.2	AUTHORSHIP	1
1.3	LIMITATIONS	1
1.4	METHODOLOGY	2
1.5	Physical Evidence	2
1.6	DOCUMENTARY AND ONLINE EVIDENCE	2
1.6.1	General References	2
1.6.2		2
1.6.3		2
1.6.4		2
1.6.5		2
1.7	SITE LOCATION	2
<u>2</u> <u>I</u>	IERITAGE MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK	3
2.1	SUMMARY OF STATUTORY HERITAGE LISTINGS	3
2.2	Relevant Heritage Legislation	4
2.3	NSW HERITAGE ACT 1977	4
2.4	Local Environmental Plan	4
2.5	DEVELOPMENT CONTROL PLAN	4
210		•
<u>3</u> <u>I</u>	HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT	5
3.1	Aboriginal Occupation	5
3.2	EUROPEAN DEVELOPMENT OF THE AREA	5
3.3	DEVELOPMENT HISTORY OF THE SUBJECT SITE	9
010		-
<u>4</u> <u>F</u>	PHYSICAL ANALYSIS	<u>15</u>
4.1	THE SITE	15
4.2	THE HARBORD HOTEL	16
4.3	THE BOTTLE SHOP	21
4.4	No. 63 Undercliffe Street	21
4.5	THE SURROUNDING AREA	22
4.5.1	THE GENERAL AREA	22
4.5.2	Moore Street	23
4.5.3	CHARLES STREET	24
4.5.4	Undercliff Road	25
4.6	INTEGRITY	25
4.7	VIEW CORRIDORS	25
<u>5</u> A	ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE	27
5.1	SUMMARY OF EXISTING CITATIONS AND LISTINGS FOR THE SITE	27
5.1.1	SUMMARY OF STATUTORY HERITAGE LISTINGS	27
5.2	HERITAGE ITEMS IN THE VICINITY OF THE SITE	28
5.2.1	'FRESHWATER' RESTAURANT, 80 UNDERCLIFF ROAD, FRESHWATER (176).	29
<i>с</i> т		20
<u>6 I</u>	PLANNING PROPOSAL	<u>30</u>
<u>7</u> <u>F</u>	EFFECT OF WORK	<u>32</u>
7.1	Method of Assessment	32
	EFFECT OF WARRINGAH LEP 2011 AMENDMENT ON THE SITE	32
7.3	EFFECT OF WARKINGAILER 2011 AMENDMENT ON THE STE EFFECT OF THE PROPOSED LEP 2011 AMENDMENT ON HERITAGE ITEMS IN THE VICINITY OF THE SITE	
1.5	LITEGI OF THE I NOT OSLO DEL ZOIT AMENDMENT ON HEATAGE HEMS IN THE VICINITI OF THE SHE	55
8 (CONCLUSIONS	34

1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Preamble

This Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) accompanies a Planning Proposal for the formal amendment of the Zoning, FSR and Height controls in the Warringah Local Environmental Plan 2011 (LEP 2011) and related DCP amendments of the site at No. 29 & 31 Moore Street and No. 64 Undercliff Street, Freshwater, New South Wales. Referred to as "the site".

The site is located within the Northern Beaches Council Local Government Area (formerly Manly, Warringah and Pittwater Councils). The principal planning control for the site is the *Warringah Local Environmental Plan 2011 (LEP 2011)*. No. 29 Moore Street, Freshwater (Harbord Hotel) <u>is</u> listed as a heritage item by Schedule 5 Part 1of the *LEP 2011*. Under Part 5.10 of the *LEP 2011*:

(4) Effect of proposed development on heritage significance

The consent authority must, before granting consent under this clause in respect of a heritage item or heritage conservation area, consider the effect of the proposed development on the heritage significance of the item or area concerned. This subclause applies regardless of whether a heritage management document is prepared under subclause (5) or a heritage conservation management plan is submitted under subclause (6).

(5) Heritage assessment

The consent authority may, before granting consent to any development:

(a) on land on which a heritage item is located, or

(b) on land that is within a heritage conservation area, or

(c) on land that is within the vicinity of land referred to in paragraph (a) or (b), require a heritage management document to be prepared that assesses the extent to which the carrying out of the proposed development would affect the heritage significance of the heritage item or heritage conservation area concerned.

In order to assess the heritage impact of the proposed changes to the planning controls on heritage items in the vicinity and the adjacent Heritage Conservation area, a heritage management document must be submitted with the Planning Proposal. The appropriate heritage management document in this instance is a HIS.

This statement has been prepared at the request of the owners of the site and accompanies plans prepared by Hot House Architects.

1.2 Authorship

This statement has been prepared by Louise Doherty, B.Sc.(Hons), Bldg Cons., and James Phillips, B.Sc.(Arch), B.Arch, M.Herit.Cons.(Hons), of Weir Phillips Heritage.

1.3 Limitations

A detailed history of the site and a full assessment of significance to Heritage NSW standards were not provided for. The history contained in this statement has been prepared from the readily available resources listed under Section 1.6 below.

An Aboriginal history and assessment was not provided for. No historical archaeology was carried out on the site.

1.4 Methodology

This HIS has been prepared with reference to the Heritage NSW publication *Statements of Heritage Impact* (2002 update) and with reference to the Council planning documents listed under Section 1.6 below.

1.5 Physical Evidence

Site visits were carried out in 2021. Unless otherwise stated, the photographs contained in this statement were taken by the authors on these occasions.

1.6 Documentary and online Evidence

1.6.1 General References

- 'Advertising', *Daily Advertiser (Wagga Wagga*, NSW: 1911 1954), 2 December, 1936 p. 7. http://nla.gov.au/nla.news-article144614135
- John Sands Ltd, John Sands *Sydney and Suburban Directories*, NSW, John Sands Ltd, various years
- Northern Beaches Local studies Library information cards:
 - Harbord Beach Hotel
 - Freshwater History of name
 - Freshwater Harbord History
- Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Australian National University: Tooth and Company yellow cards, various records.

1.6.2 Historic Maps, Plans, Photographs

• (Aerial Photograph over Freshwater) 1943. NSW Lands Department.

1.6.3 Council Planning Documents

- Warringah Development Control Plan 2011.
- Warringah Local Environmental Plan 2011.

1.6.4 Heritage Inventory Listing Sheets

- *Harbord Beach Hotel*, 29 Moore Road, Freshwater. Heritage Act, SHI Database No. 2610063.
- *'Freshwater' Restaurant*, 80 Undercliff Road, Freshwater. Heritage Act, SHI Database No. 2610064.

1.6.5 10ther

• NSW Heritage Office and DUAP, *Statements of* Heritage *Impact*, NSW, Heritage Office and DUAP, 2002 (update).

1.7 Site Location

The site, shown bound with red in Figure 1 is located on the southern side of Moore Road. The western boundary of the site addresses Charles Street and Undercliff Road is located to the south. The site is identified as Lots 1-6 Section 1 of D.P. 7022 and Lot 13 Section 1 of D.P. 7022



Figure 1: The location of the subject site outlined in red. SIX Maps.

2 HERITAGE MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK

2.1 Summary of Statutory Heritage Listings

No. 29 Moore Road, Freshwater:

- <u>Is</u> listed as an item of local heritage significance by Schedule 5 Part 1 of *Warringah LEP 2011.*
- Is <u>not</u> located within a Conservation Area as defined by Schedule 5 Part 2 of the *Warringah LEP 2011*.
- Is <u>not</u> listed as a heritage item on the State Heritage Register under the auspices of the *NSW Heritage Act* 1977.
- It is not listed as a heritage item on the National or Commonwealth Heritage List.

The site is located within the vicinity of a heritage item listed by Schedule 5 Part 1 of the *Warringah LEP 2013*. Details of the items identified significance can be found in Section 5.0.

Figure 2 provides detail from the Warringah Heritage Map (*LEP 2011*), which identifies heritage items, listed by Schedule 5 Part 1 of the *LEP 2011*, in the vicinity of the site. Heritage items are coloured brown and numbered, conservation areas are hatched and outlined in red. The site is indicated by the blue arrow.

The subject site is located within the vicinity of the locally listed 'Freshwater' Restaurant, No. 80 Undercliff Road, Freshwater (I76).



Figure 2 Detail from the Heritage Plan, Warringah Local Environmental Plan 2011 Heritage Map - Sheet HER_010.

2.2 Relevant Heritage Legislation

In Australia and NSW, heritage listings give rise to statutory requirements to consider the heritage impact of any proposed works on a heritage item. The following requirements are relevant to any works being proposed to the site.

2.3 NSW Heritage Act 1977

The *NSW Heritage Act 1977* provides statutory obligations for the conservation of items of heritage significance in NSW. Places, buildings, works, relics, movable objects or precincts considered to be of significance for the whole of NSW are listed on the State Heritage Register (SHR). The SHR is administered by the Heritage Division of the Office of Environment and Heritage (OEH) and includes a diverse range of over 1500 items. Any alteration to these assets is governed by heritage guidelines and works cannot be carried out without prior approval from the Heritage Council of NSW.

The proposal does not require assessment under the *NSW Heritage Act 1977* as no part of the site is listed within curtilage of the heritage items listed under this act.

2.4 Local Environmental Plan

In NSW, the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act, 1979 (EP&A Act)* sets out statutory obligations for local governments to take into consideration the impacts to the environment and the community of any proposed development or land-use change. Under the *EP&A Act,* local government must prepare and implement a Local Environmental Plan (LEP) to regulate development within their respective Local Government Area (LGA).

The proposal is assessed with regard to heritage under Section 5.10 of the Warringah LEP 2011 (refer to Section 7.0 of this report).

2.5 Development Control Plan

Development Control Plans (DCP) provide detailed planning and design guidelines to support the planning controls in the Local Environmental Plan (LEP). The *Warringah Development Control Plan* was prepared and adopted in 2011 by the former Warringah

Council (Warringah *DCP 2011*). It identifies the Northern Beaches Council's requirements for new projects on land to which the *Warringah LEP 2011* applies.

The Warringah LEP 2011 does not contain any clauses relating to heritage conservation.

3 HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT

3.1 Aboriginal Occupation

Although, Aboriginal Heritage was not provided for the traditional owners who lived, fished and gathered food right across the Northern Beaches for thousands of years are acknowledged as traditional custodians of the land.

3.2 European development of the area

The first European exploration of the Northern Beaches area was led by Governor Arthur Phillip. The expedition is said to have travelled followed Manly Creek towards Manly Dam then towards Frenches Forest terminating at Middle Harbour where a waiting boat took them back to Sydney Cove.

Phillip determined that the land was unsuitable for farm pasture and turned his attention to other areas which may be more suited to providing food security to the fledgling colony.

The coast line from Manly to Palm Beach was surveyed in 1815 by Government Surveyor James Meehan. The first land grant in the area comprising 50 acres was made to Thomas Bruin to the immediate north of Freshwater Beach near to the current day location of the Harbord Diggers RSL Club. Bruin sold his grant to D'Arcy Wentworth in 1818. The surrounding area along Freshwater Beach was designated as Crown Land.

Transport to the area did not develop until the late 1870s when Harbord Road was constructed and the steps over Queenscliff headland built in the following decade.¹

The present-day suburb of Freshwater was surveyed in 1886 by W.M. Gordon and prepared for subdivision. The Harbord Estate was named in honour of the governor of NSW Sister in Law Judith Harbord. Harbord was accompanying the Governor-General and his wife Lady Carrington around NSW and was earning publicity at the time in the social pages. 2

However, the Crown land surrounding Freshwater Beach was remained un-subdivided until the late 1890s when it was offered for sale by the Minister of Lands as detailed in Figure 3.

5

¹ Northern Beaches Local Studies Library, Freshwater Harbord History information sheet.

² Northern Beaches Local Studies Library, Freshwater History of name. information sheet.

CROWN LAND SALE.

Under instructions from the Minister for Lands, Mr. Broughton offered yesterday 132 allotments of Harbord Estate, Manly Beach, lying for the most part between Curl Curl and Manly Lagoons, distant from a mile to a mile and threequarters from Manly proper. The lots consisted chiefly of 2 rood areas, and the Government upset price ranged from f5 to f72 per block. Altogether 17 allotments were sold, from f5 up to f13 15s per block, which in several instances was considerably over the Government upset.

Figure 3: Newspaper article advertising the 1899 sale of land at Freshwater 'CROWN LAND SALE.', Evening News (Sydney, NSW: 1869 - 1931), 20 October, 1899 p. 3., viewed 21 Apr 2020, http://nla.gov.au/nla.news-article113690428

The earliest European name for the suburb was Freshwater, this is believed to have derived from the fresh water stream that ran to the beach.

Freshwater's popularity grew as a holiday destination for workers from the inner western suburbs of Sydney grew after the legalisation of sea bathing in 1903. Early camps were established with tents and weatherboard huts providing weekend holiday accommodation. The 'Camps' were for men only; women were permitted to visit on Sunday.



Figure 4: Jolly Boys Camp Freshwater. Source Northern Beaches Council Library



Figure 5: Dollar Princess Camp Freshwater. Source Northern Beaches Council Library

Other businesses were established to support the camps including stores and eventually a tearoom.



Figure 6: Randells Store c.1910 Source Northern Beaches Council Library

Further services emerged in 1908 with the establishment of the Freshwater Surf Life Saving club and the Freshwater Restaurant (now Pilu Restaurant). In its early days the building was known as 'The Kiosk' was used as a venue for afternoon tea parties, meetings and dances as well as providing accommodation



Figure 7: The kiosk is shown to the centre of the image. A camp site can be seen to left of the image and small houses or huts in the distance. Source Northern Beaches Council Library

Other early services including St Marks Anglican Church which opened in 1911, and Freshwater Public School which opened the following year. The school was later renamed Harbord Public School.

In the early 20th century many of the estates were subdivided and prepared for residential development. A significant event for Freshwater and Australia's surf culture occurred in 1914 when Hawaiian Duke Kahanamolu stayed at Boomerang Camp and demonstrated Hawaiian style surfing at Freshwater Beach on a board made from local timber.



Figure 8: Duke Kahanamolu Source: SurferToday

From 1925-1939 a tramline operated from Pittwater Road terminating at Moore Street to the immediate north of the 'Freshwater Restaurant'.

The camps at Freshwater had a rough and rowdy reputation. Many of the local residents were concerned that this reputation was negatively impacting the impression of their suburb and they successfully petitioned for the name to be changed to Harbord in recognition of one of the earliest subdivisions in the area. Not everybody agreed with the name change and the Freshwater SLSC refused to change their name resulting in the Beach and the Surf Life Saving Club bearing different names until 1980s when the Geographical Names Board was successfully petitioned by the community, Manly Warringah and Pittwater Historical Society and Warringah Council to change the name of the beach back to Freshwater. The suburb of Harbord was officially re-named Freshwater on 12 January 2008. ³

During the late 1920s – 1930s two important social venues were established in the suburb: The Harbord Beach Hotel, refer to Section 2.3, and the The Harbord Legion of Ex-Diggers (known as Harbord Diggers). The Diggers opened in 5 June 1930 as a social club for returned servicemen. The first building was a hut near Freshwater Beach. The club raised money for members in distress and their families by serving billy teas to holiday makers. When the hut was washed away during a storm in 1933, it was moved to the first of several temporary sites until finally relocating to its current headland location in the late 1950s.

From the 1960s the population of Harbord increased greatly as strata title legislation was introduced resulting in smaller residential dwellings being demolished and replaced with residential flat buildings. This continued until 1973 when a resident action group petitioned Council to restrict home unit development. Planning Controls were introduced after this time to curb the development. ⁴

3.3 Development history of the subject site

Harbord Beach Hotel opened on 24th December 1928. The owner and first publican, Mr Hope-Catlin is said to have modelled the building on a design he brought back from South Africa.⁵

Figure 9 shows the original form of the building, the two storey rendered building was set beneath a wide hipped roof with a large street facing half hipped gable and smaller complete gable addressing Moore Street. The two-storey verandah did not extend to the full extent of the principal elevation instead terminating one bay past the front porch. A set of steps is shown leading from Charles Street to the front entry. The entry to the steps is flanked by a pair of rectangular posts which have a hole in the top where a plant can be placed.

A two storey concrete verandah wrapped around the eastern end of the building. The solid concrete base of the verandah topped with a decorative band of concrete blocks, this detail is seen to both the ground and first floor balustrades. The verandah is separated into a series of bays by evenly spaced wide concrete posts. The ground floor openings are topped by arches set between the posts. The posts extend above the top of the first-floor balustrade.

The centre of the principal elevation was defined by a concrete porch supported by wide concrete posts. The building was accessed via a central set of steps within the porch.

The land to the front of the building, now enclosed courtyards, was open and elevated above the road height.

³ Northern Beaches Local Studies Library, Freshwater History of name information sheet.

⁴ Northern Beaches Local Studies Library, Freshwater Harbord History information sheet.

⁵ Gordon G, 2000, Harbord Queenscliff and South Curl Curl 1788-2000, p24

The Charles Street elevation is set beneath a half-hipped gable. The upper level contains three metal framed casement windows. This style of window can also be seen to the first floor of the Moore Street elevation. The ground floor contains a large metal framed window to the north and a pair of entry doors to the south set beneath a cantilevered awning.



Figure 9: The western elevation of the Harbord Beach Hotel in August 1930 Source: Noel Butlin Archives

The hotel was purchased by Tooth and Co. in February 1935. The records kept by the brewery indicate that £906 was spend on constructing new garages and alterations to the public and salon bars in the following year. There were 15 bedrooms (7 single, 6 double and 2 triple) a saloon bar, a public bar, lounges and a bottle store.⁶

As shown in Figure 10, a 1936 advertisement for the Harbord Beach Hotel run in several regional newspapers boast details the hotel as having Tennis Courts, Garages and Good Tables.



Figure 10: 1936 Advertisement for the Harbord Beach Hotel

'Advertising', *Daily Advertiser (Wagga Wagga*, NSW: 1911-1954), 2 December, 1936 p. 7. http://nla.gov.au/nla.news-article144614135

⁶ Noel Butlin Archives Harbord Beach Hotel, Card 3 side 2

Figure 11 provides an aerial photograph over the site and the immediate surrounding area in 1943. The roof form does not appear to have changed since this image was taken. In addition to the main hotel there are structures to the south and east of the building. It is not clear where the tennis courts mentioned in figure 10 are located or if they had been removed by this time. The character of the area is noted as being sparsely developed. Note also the verandahs to either side of the front porch have not yet been built.



Figure 11: Aerial photograph over the site and surrounding area in 1943. The subject site is indicated by the red arrow. SIX Maps

By 1949, (Figure 12), The building appears to have undergone little external change particularly when viewed from the west. The photo does show the lintels above the windows matching those on the Porte Cochere. Painted signage was added to the Porte Cochere and a large freestanding Tooth's sign was installed at the street edge. Also noted is the addition of blinds to the ground floor verandah area. These were externally mounted and gave the appearance of rectangular opening where they had previously been arched.

Tooth's records for the building note that the ground floor public bar and saloon bar were tiled. Bedrooms were shown as being for staff and public with additional private quarters containing three twin rooms. The district was described by Tooths as:

'Residential. Large holiday trade and weekday and weekend surfers'⁷

⁷ Noel Butlin Archives Harbord Beach Hotel card 4 side 2



Figure 12: The Harbord Beach Hotel in 1949 Noel Butlin Archives Harbord Beach Hotel card 4 side 2



Figure 13: 1955 Aerial of the site. Note that No.64 Undercliff Street is present at this time. NSW Department of Customer Services

Comparison of the 1943 aerial image, refer to Figure 11 and the1955 aerial image Figure 13 demonstrate that changes to the wider area included the construction of several neighbouring buildings including No.64 Undercliff Street.

A significant phase of alteration, both internally and externally occurred in the late 1950s the changes included:

- Enclosing verandah forming new servery.
- Construct shelters, beer garden and paving to the front of the Hotel.
- Construct new bottle dept.

- the conversion of the lounge bar to act as an extension of the saloon bar.
- Enlarging the saloon bar lavatories and women's toilet block.
- Forming a lounge bar by provision of a folding screen in the dining room and other minor alterations.
- Provision of an acoustic ceiling to the lounge bar.
- Clearing of land at the rear of hotel, form ramp, construct gutter crossing and cover area with hard ashes for car parking area.⁸

The image of the building dating from 1960, refer Figure 14, clearly demonstrates the extent of the above external alterations. The area to the front of the hotel had been extended to the road and enclosed to create the beer garden, pergola structures were provided for shade, a small rectangular flat roofed building, accessed from Charles Street, acted as a bottle shop. The enclosure of the ground floor verandah area is also evident. Other changes include illuminated external 'saloon bar' sign, the tudor-esque painting of the gable infil and an external blind to the Charles Street window.



Figure 14: Harbord Beach Hotel 1960.

Noel Butlin Archives Harbord Beach Hotel card 5 side 2

By 1982, only cosmetic changed had been made to the exterior of the property, refer to Figure 15. The changes included the external painting, external awnings were mounted above the windows, additional signage installed to the Moore Street elevation and signwriting to the Charles Street awning. Also noted are the doors addressing Charles Street which are still shown in place.

In 1982, the current bottle shop was constructed to the immediate east of the property addressing Charles Street, refer to Figure 16. Also shown in this photo is the rear of No.64 Moore Street, Freshwater.

⁸ Noel Butlin Archives Harbord Beach Hotel card 5 side 2



Figure 15: Harbord Beach Hotel, 1982 Northern Beaches Local Studies ref: 40\WAR40550



Figure 16: Construction of the bottleshop, 1982 Northern Beaches Local Studies ref: 40\WAR40544

By 2020, several significant alterations had been undertaken to the exterior of the building these included:

- Removal of the Charles Street bottleshop.
- Conversion of the Charles Street door to windows
- Replacement of the first-floor metal casement windows with sliding aluminium framed windows
- Extension of the former saloon bar to the line of the ground floor verandah,
- Removal of Charles Street steps,
- Extension of the second-floor verandah to the full width of the Moore Street elevation.
- Addition of a glazed extension to the top of the perimeter walls.



Figure 17: Current external appearance of the building January 2021.

The recent external alterations to the building undertaken in 2021 included:

- Addition of an entry door to the Charles Street elevation.
- Upgrade to the metal framed doors to the principal elevation with sliding doors.
- Aesthetic upgrade of the boundary wall and external appearance of the property

4 PHYSICAL ANALYSIS

4.1 The Site

For the following, refer to Figure 18, an aerial photograph over the site, and to the survey that accompanies this application. To match the accompanying plans Moore Road is referred to as being to the north, Charles Street to the west and Undercliffe Road to the south.



Figure 18: An aerial photograph showing the subject site highlighted in yellow and bound in red and its surrounds. SIX Maps.

The site is located on the southern corner of the intersection of Moore Road and Charles Street. The site is approximately 63m in length and 56m in width. The overall site area comprises approximately 3058 sq. metres. The hotel is located to the northern corner of the site, the bottle shop is located to the east, the residence know as No.64 Undercliff Road is located to the south and a hard stand car park to the west.



Figure 19: Detail of the car park to the southern portion of the site.

4.2 The Harbord Hotel

The principal elevation, addressing Moore Road, is typical of an extensively modified and extended two storey, Inter-War Style Hotel. The building presents a side elevation to Charles Street. The Hotel is accessed via a central front porch bearing signage reading 'Harbord Hotel'.

The painted concrete rendered building is set beneath a wide half hipped gable roof clad with terracotta tiles. There is a street facing gable located over the centre of the principal elevation. The gables have timber batten infills. An open concrete verandah runs across the full width of the first floor. The first-floor balustrade is separated into a series of bay with masonry posts which extend above the balustrade.

The first floor of the principal elevation, set behind the masonry balustrade, has a full width verandah the floor of which is covered with a grey membrane. The elevation has a projecting tiled hipped verandah roof with exposed timber rafters to the centre and eastern section of the first floor. The hipped verandah roof is supported by timber struts which are tied to the elevation. Above the hipped verandah roof are the main rood forms comprising a gable, hipped gable and main hipped roof form.

The first-floor windows have been replaced with modern aluminium framed sliding windows. There is a set of glazed timber doors to the verandah.

Figure 20 - Figure 24 demonstrate the external appearance of building.



Figure 20: The front (northern) elevation of No. 29 Moore Road, Freshwater.



Figure 21: The hipped roof to the centre and eastern section of the elevation.



Figure 22: Detail of tiled verandah roof and sliding aluminium framed windows.



Figure 23: The timber and glass door leading to the verandah.



Figure 24: The rear of the masonry balustrade.

The eastern elevation of the building includes the return of the first floor verandah which is similar in appearance to that of the principal elevation described above. This section of the building contains a set of timber and glass French doors and a sliding aluminium framed door.

To the southern section of this façade is consistent in appearance with a secondary elevation. The plainly decorated elevation is set beneath a terracotta tiled hipped roof exposed timber rafters. The roof has two masonry chimneys, the northern of which is decorated with a square cap and four square vent holes to its top. The southern chimney is uncapped and less decorative in appearance. The southern portion of this elevation contains irregularly spaced aluminium framed windows and is intersected by numerous service pipes.

Refer to Figure 25- Figure 27.



Figure 25 Eastern Elevation.



Figure 26 Aluminium framed sliding doors.



The southern elevation addresses the Hotels Car Park it is comprised of two sections referred to below as east and west.

The eastern two storey hipped gable end of the eastern wing of the building. This elevation is simply decorated and finished with painted rendered masonry. There is a simply detailed timber infil to the gable end and irregularly spaced aluminium framed windows. Refer to Figure 28.



Figure 28: Southern elevation.

The western portion of the southern elevation will not be altered by the current proposal. This section of the building contains the single storey rear entry to the building, the smoking area and stairs to the staff entry, refer to Figure 29.



Figure 29: Southern elevation.

The Charles Street elevation is constructed of painted concrete set beneath a hipped gable end. The first-floor windows have been replaced with modern sliding aluminium framed windows, refer to Figure 30.



Figure 30: Charles Street elevation.

4.3 The Bottle Shop

As detailed in Section 3 of this report, the bottleshop was added to the site in early 1980s. The principal elevation, addressing Moore Road, is typical of a c.1980s single storey commercial drive through bottleshop. The painted rick building is set beneath a flat roof. There is a tiled awning to the northern elevation and a modern cantilevered awning extending from the western elevation of the building. This cantilevered awning is set over the drive through lanes.

In addition to the drive through lanes there is a pedestrian access within the northern elevation indicated by the recently upgraded bottleshop sign. The site contains an area of grass to the north eastern corner, a set of concrete steps leading to the street and further modern commercial signage.

Figure 31 and Figure 32 demonstrate the external appearance of the bottle shop.



Figure 31: The front (northern) elevation of No. 31 Moore Road, Freshwater.



Figure 32: View to the rear of the building form within the site.

4.4 No. 63 Undercliffe Street

No. 63 Undercliffe Street is a mid 20th century duplex building.

The painted concrete rendered building is set beneath a flat roof. The principal elevation (southern) has two pairs of wide timber sash windows flanked with decorative shutters to both the ground and first floor. A set of concrete steps located to the south east corner of the site lead to the upper floor.

The eastern and western elevation have similar windows to the first and second floor and there is a further set of steps providing access to the rear of the duplex building.

Figure 33 and Figure 34 demonstrate the external appearance of building.



Figure 33: The front (southern) elevation of No. 64 Undercliff Street, Freshwater.



Figure 34: The western elevation of No.64 Undercliff Street , Freshwater

4.5 The Surrounding Area

For the following, refer to Figure 35 an aerial photograph over the site and the surrounding area.

4.5.1 The General Area

The subject building is located on the southern corner of the junction of Moore Road and Charles Street within an established residential precinct. Alfred Street to the west is the commercial hub of Freshwater Village. To the east is Freshwater Beach.



Figure 35: Aerial photograph over the site and the surrounding area. The site is highlighted in yellow. SIX Maps.

4.5.2 Moore Street

Moore Street runs from Albert Street in the northwest and to the southernmost Freshwater Beach car park in the south east. The built form is predominantly residential and comprises of a mix of three and four storey residential flat buildings and detached two storey dwellings. The building date from the inter-war era to the present day.

As noted above, the subject building is located on the southern corner of the junction of Moore Road and Charles Street. The building to the east is the single storey bottle shop attached to the hotel. Further east the buildings are three storey residential flat buildings. Directly opposite the subject building, on the northern side of Moore Road, is a group of detached two storey dwellings all of which date from the modern era.

Figure 36-Figure 38 illustrate the general character of the street in the vicinity of the site.



Figure 36: General character of Moore Street to the east of the hotel.



Figure 37: Typical built form of Moore Road.



Figure 38: Residential buildings Directly opposite the Hotel.

4.5.3 Charles Street

The subject property is located to the eastern side of Charles Street. Directly opposite on the western side of the street are two single storey brick cottages and the side elevation of the residential flat building known as No. 27 Moore Street, Freshwater.

Figure 39 illustrates the general character of Charles Street in the vicinity of the site.



Figure 39: General character of Charles Street.

4.5.4 Undercliff Road

The subject property is located to the northern side of Undercliff Road. Several freestanding residential dwellings are located to the southern side of the street directly opposite the site. The residential buildings are constructed of a range of materials and are orientated towards the ocean views to the east.

Figure 40 illustrates the general character of Undercliff Road Street in the vicinity of the site.



Figure 40: General character of Undercliff Road.

4.6 Integrity

The current building on site has been substantially altered since its c.1928 construction. The notable external changes include: the internalisation of the ground floor verandah, the extension of the first floor verandah, the construction of the perimeter walls to create internal courtyards, the removal of the original windows, the conversion of the Charles Street entry to windows and the rear single storey additions. The building has also undergone internal change.

The integrity of the building has also been affected by the changing nature of the building. In its original form the upper level of the building would have provided hotel accommodation for holiday makers, this practise has fallen out of favour with holiday makers preferring not to stay above busy hotels. It is also noted that the former practice of hoteliers and their families living above the hotel and restaurants is no longer typical. This has resulted in the first-floor accommodation becoming redundant and a separate Development Application for its adaptive re-use has been lodged with Council.

The exterior of the building retains some key aspects of its original decorative characteristics which are predominantly exhibited through the remnant detailing to the first floor, roof scape Moore Street and Charles Street elevation. Despite the diminished integrity, the building is well maintained. As noted previously the rear of the building has been extensively altered with several additions. The rear of the building does not clearly demonstrate the key aesthetic characteristics of the c.1928 era of construction.

The building demonstrates a moderate degree of architectural integrity.

4.7 View Corridors

Views to the building are uninhibited. The principal view corridors are obtained are from Moore Road and Charles Street in front of the site. Secondary views to the rear of

25

the building are obtained from Undercliff Street however as noted above these are not considered to be significant view angles and do not provide any understanding of the buildings Key architectural and aesthetic features which are viewed from Moore Road and Charles Street.

The building is a visual landmark in close proximity to Freshwater Beach.

Refer to Figure 41- Figure 44



Figure 41: View of the subject site from Moore Road.



Figure 42 View of the building from the west.





Figure 44 View of the building from the Undercliff Road.

5 ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

5.1 Summary of Existing Citations and Listings for the Site

5.1.1 Summary of Statutory Heritage Listings

No. 29 Moore Road, Freshwater:

- <u>Is</u> listed as an item of local heritage significance by Schedule 5 Part 1 of *Warringah LEP 2011.*
- Is <u>not</u> located within a Conservation Area as defined by Schedule 5 Part 2 of the *Warringah LEP 2011*.
- Is <u>not</u> listed as a heritage item on the State Heritage Register under the auspices of the *NSW Heritage Act* 1977.

The State Heritage Inventory Listing Sheet provides the following statement of significance for the subject property known as Harbord Beach Hotel, 29 Moore Street, Freshwater:

A rare example of an inter-war hotel building which shows influences of the Californian bungalow style. Historically provides evidence of the

27

early development of social & recreational facilities to serve the growing population. Local landmark.⁹

This statement is adopted for the purposes of this report.

No. 31 Moore Road, Freshwater:

- Is <u>not</u> listed as an item of local heritage significance by Schedule 5 Part 1 of *Warringah LEP 2011*.
- Is <u>not</u> located within a Conservation Area as defined by Schedule 5 Part 2 of the *Warringah LEP 2011*.
- Is <u>not</u> listed as a heritage item on the State Heritage Register under the auspices of the *NSW Heritage Act 1977*.

No. 63 Undercliffe Street, Freshwater:

- Is <u>not</u> listed as an item of local heritage significance by Schedule 5 Part 1 of *Warringah LEP 2011*.
- Is <u>not</u> located within a Conservation Area as defined by Schedule 5 Part 2 of the *Warringah LEP 2011*.
- Is <u>not</u> listed as a heritage item on the State Heritage Register under the auspices of the *NSW Heritage Act* 1977.

5.2 Heritage Items in the Vicinity of the Site

For the following 'in the vicinity' is determined by the distance between the site and heritage items, the nature of the proposed works, the character of the area and existing and potential view corridors. In Figure 45, a detail from the *Warringah LEP 2011* heritage plan, heritage items are coloured brown and numbered. Conservation Areas are hatched in red. The site is indicated by the blue arrow.



Figure 45 Detail from the Heritage Plan, Warringah Local Environmental Plan 2011 Heritage Map - Sheet HER_010.

The subject site is located within the vicinity of the locally listed 'Freshwater' Restaurant, 80 Undercliff Road, Freshwater (I76).

⁹ Harbord Beach Hotel, 29 Moore Road, Freshwater. Heritage Act, SHI Database No. 2610063

5.2.1 'Freshwater' Restaurant, 80 Undercliff Road, Freshwater (I76).

'Freshwater' Restaurant is located to the east of the subject property on the neighbouring Undercliff Road. The Restaurant addresses Freshwater Beach and is located to the eastern end of the Freshwater Beach car park, formerly the Moore Street tram terminal. The restaurant is not visible from the subject property nor does it share any significant view corridors with the subject property.

The State Heritage Inventory Listing Sheet provides the following statement of significance for this item:

A building with great social & historical significance as an early meeting place & recreation venue for the first settlers in Freshwater. Representative of the federation style, with high integrity. Prominent local landmark located above Freshwater Beach.¹⁰



Figure 46: No. 80 Undercliff Road, Freshwater.



Figure 47: The Harbord beach Hotel is not visible from No. 80 Undercliff Road, Freshwater

Figure 48, provided below, demonstrates the location of the No. 80 Undercliff Road, indicated by the yellow arrow, and the location of the subject property, indicated by the blue arrow. This figure clearly demonstrates that there no visual links between the neighbouring heritage item and the subject property due to their location and the intervening neighbouring properties.

¹⁰ '*Freshwater' Restaurant*, 80 Undercliff Road, Freshwater. Heritage Act, SHI Database No. 2610064.

No historical links between the neighbouring restaurant and the subject property have been determined during the preparation of this report.



Figure 48: There are no visual links between No. 80 Undercliff Road, indicated by the yellow arrow, and the subject property, indicated by the blue arrow. Six Viewer Annotated by Weir Phillips Heritage and Planning

6 PLANNING PROPOSAL

The Planning Proposal has been prepared to amend the Schedule 1 – Additional Per Permitted Uses, Clause 14 of the *Warringah LEP 2011* which currently reads:

14 Use of certain land at 29 Moore Road, Freshwater

(1) This clause applies to land at 29 Moore Road, Freshwater, being Lots 1–5, Section 1, DP 7022 and Lot 13, Section 1, DP 7022, shown as "Area 14" on the Additional Permitted Uses Map.

(2) Development for the purposes of pubs is permitted with consent.



Figure 49: Extract of Additional Permitted uses Map 10 showing the current extent of Area 14. The arrow indicates Lot 6 DP 7022. Warringah LEP 2011 Annotated Weir Phillips Heritage and planning.

The Planning Proposal seeks to amend the above Warringah LEP 2011 standards:

WLEP 2011 - Schedule 1 Additional Permitted Uses, Clause 14, to include Lot 6 DP 7022 and hotel accommodation.

This HIS focuses on the scope and impacts of the Planning Proposal, which relates to proposed changes to planning controls only (no physical works are proposed).

A future Development Application will be prepared for the site for demolition, site amalgamation and detailed design.

Figure 50 - Figure 52 are extracts of the plans prepared by Hot House Architect which accompany this application and provide an understanding of the future development of the site.



Figure 51: Planning Proposal North and South elevations. Hot House Architects 2021



Figure 52: Planning Proposal East and West elevations. Hot House Architects 2021.

7 EFFECT OF WORK

The following should be read in conjunction with the plans prepared by Hot House Architects that accompany this planning proposal.

7.1 Method of Assessment

The following considers heritage related issues only. It does not consider compliance or otherwise with numerical controls unless non-compliance will result in an adverse heritage impact. For such an assessment, refer to the Statement of Environmental Effects (SEE) that accompanies this application.

The effect of work is assessed with an understanding of the relevant provisions of the *Warringah LEP 2011* and *Warringah DCP 2011*.

7.2 Effect of Warringah LEP 2011 Amendment on the Site

As detailed in section 6 of this report, the proposal seeks to include Lot 6 DP 7022 within WLEP 2011 - Schedule 1 Additional Permitted Uses, Clause 14 and include Hotel Accommodation.

Changes to the controls will facilitate the construction of a two storey Hotel Accommodation building with an additional two levels of basement parking and will require the demolition of No.64 Undercliffe Road. While the existing Harbord Hotel building is listed neither the bottle shop at No.31 Moore Road nor No.64 Undercliffe Road are considered to be of heritage significance either within the Warringah LEP, DCP or by this HIS. The site is not located in a Heritage Conservation Area.

The potential impact to the existing hotel building made by the proposed changes to the planning controls is acceptable for the following reasons:

• The planning proposal massing diagrams illustrate that the development includes a single storey to the north eastern portion of the site, respecting the scale of the existing bottle shop while the proposed hotel accommodation to

the rear of the site is two storeys in height which is in keeping with the existing character of both the site and the surrounding built context.

- The proposed development to the rear of the site located within in the existing above ground car park and to No. 64 Undercliffe Road, Lot 6 DP 7022, which currently contains a two-storey building, refer to Section 4.4 of this report. The carport and existing structure at No. 64 Undercliffe Road have not been identified as containing any significant original features or structures which contribute to the identified heritage values of the Hotel.
- The rear (southern) elevation of the Hotel is characterised by an irregular assortment of extensions and alterations to the hotel building. With the exception of the roof form, the rear (southern) elevation of the Hotel not been identified as containing any significant original features which contribute to the identified heritage values of the Hotel.
- The architectural, historic and/or social significance of the Harbord Hotel will not be impacted upon. The Planning Proposal is to increase the site area and change controls to allow hotel accommodation. It is noted that the Hotel has previously provided tourist accommodation and the proposed addition of accommodation to the site is in keeping with the original and historic use of the building. The intention of the planning proposal is to permit the site to accommodate the evolving requirements of holiday makers who no longer desire holiday accommodation above a busy public bar and restaurant. . However, demand remains high for motel/self-contained units. This proposal will allow the Harbord Hotel to respond to the changing requirements of Holiday accommodation whilst continuing to operate as an entertainment venue. A detailed proposal of the accommodation structure will need to be designed and assessed on its own merits.
- The planning proposal has been development to ensure that the principal view angles to the Harbord Hotel from Moore Road and Charles Street are retained. The proposal where visible from Undercliff Street will enhance the appearance of the site as the roof of the original building will remain visible whilst limiting views to the series of adhoc additions to the rear of the building.

7.3 Effect of the proposed *LEP 2011* amendment on Heritage Items in the Vicinity of the Site

The proposed amendments to the LEP, detailed above will result in a greater built volume within the site. However, this will not have an impact on the Heritage Items in the vicinity for the following reasons:

The proposed works will have a minimal and acceptable impact on the significance of the 'Freshwater' Restaurant for the following reasons:

- The proposed works will not be visible from the neighbouring heritage item. Accordingly, the proposed works will not impact the ability to view and understand the neighbouring heritage item.
- Views to and from the neighbouring item will not be affected by the proposed works.
- The architectural, historic and/or social significance of the heritage item the vicinity of the site will not be impacted upon. The Planning Proposal is to confined to the Harbord Hotel site only. A detailed proposal will need to be designed having regard to these factors.
- The degree of separation from the heritage items is sufficient to have no direct

impact on the lot boundary curtilage of these items. The 'Freshwater' Restaurant to the east is separated from the site by intervening buildings and a public reserve.

- The form and scale of the proposal is moderated through its location to the rear of the site in a currently underutilised area of car park.
- The proposed change of use to permit hotel accommodation is consistent with the character of the area and responds to the changing nature of hotel accommodation demonstrating a preference for purpose built hotel/motel accommodation rather than staying above an operating hotel.

8 CONCLUSIONS

The changes to the planning controls relating to No. 29 & 31 Moore Street and No. 64 Undercliff Street, Freshwater will have an acceptable impact on heritage listed Hotel and the neighbouring heritage item for the following reasons:

- The proposed future massing has been formulated to respond to the existing built forms within the site and in the surrounding residential area. The density is greatest to the south in order to minimise significant view angles to the Moore Street elevation and located within a section of the site which has not been identified as contributing to the heritage significance of the Harbord Hotel.
- The proposed height of the permissible building envelope is consistent with that of the Harbord Hotel and surrounding residential area.
- The proposed development is separated from the neighbouring heritage listed 'Pilu' restaurant building by intervening buildings and an area of public reserve.
- The Planning Proposal is for an accommodation building on the site and will also provide landscape open space. The proposed building envelope closely relates to residential scale in along Undercliff Street, Charles Street and Moore Road.
- The proposed future developable area is located to east and to the rear of the hotel building which is not the primary or significant aspect. The character of the proposed developable area is characterised by a single storey bottleshop an informal carpark and amid century duplex building. The proposed change of zoning to incorporate hotel accommodation is consistent with the historic and ongoing use of the site. The primary elevation of the heritage listed will not impacted.
- The duplex building and bottleshop on the site are not considered to be of heritage significance, being nondescript examples of contemporary, architecture. They are not listed as Heritage items or located in a Heritage Conservation Area as listed by the Warringah LEP 2011.
- The proposed planning amendments to rezone the site, to allow for hotel accommodation is generally consistent with the character of Freshwater as a beach side suburb.